

Clause 5 in Report No. 8 of Committee of the Whole was adopted, without amendment, by the Council of The Regional Municipality of York at its meeting held on May 17, 2018.

5

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand
Transit Service Contracts

Committee of the Whole recommends adoption of the following recommendations contained in the report dated April 19, 2018 from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. Council approve the award of P-17-92 and authorize the execution of the contract for the operation, maintenance, supply and storage of sedans and accessible mini-vans to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand transit services to three contractors:
 - a) Mobility Transportation Specialists 2321190 Ontario Inc., in an amount of approximately \$18,511,642, excluding HST
 - b) Cares Accessible Transportation in an amount of approximately \$19,778,824, excluding HST
 - c) Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc. in an amount of approximately \$18,543,669, excluding HST

These amounts would be paid by the Region over the initial five-year term.

Contracts include a renewal option for an additional term of up to five years.

The amounts include start-up activities, service delivery vehicle purchase, maintenance and fuel.

The contract start-up activities would commence on Monday, June 4, 2018 and would terminate at the conclusion of the service on Saturday, September 27, 2025.

2. Council approve the award of P-17-101 and authorize the execution of the contract for the operation, maintenance and storage of Region-owned buses and mini-buses, to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand transit to one contractor:
 - a) Tok Transit in an amount of approximately \$27,450,768, excluding HST.

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand
Transit Services Contracts

This amount would be paid by the Region over the initial seven-year term.

The contract includes a renewal option for an additional term of up to three years.

The amount includes start-up activities, service delivery, maintenance of Region-owned and fuel.

The contract start-up activities would commence on Monday, June 4, 2018 and would terminate at the conclusion of the service on Saturday, September 27, 2025.

3. The Commissioner of Transportation Services be authorized to execute the option to renew the contracts, as specified above, subject to contractors meeting the performance targets identified in the contract throughout the initial term.
4. Council approve the extension of the current service providers, Cares Accessible Transportation, Mobility Transportation Specialists 2321190 Ontario Inc., and Royal Taxi, under contract numbers 82909, 82910, 82912, until the conclusion of service on September 29, 2018, at which time, the provision of the contracts will switch over to the contractors noted above.

Report dated April 19, 2018 from the Commissioner of Transportation Services now follows:

1. Recommendations

It is recommended that:

1. Council approve the award of P-17-92 and authorize the execution of the contract for the operation, maintenance, supply and storage of sedans and accessible mini-vans to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand transit services to three contractors:
 - a) Mobility Transportation Specialists 2321190 Ontario Inc., in an amount of approximately \$18,511,642, excluding HST
 - b) Cares Accessible Transportation in an amount of approximately \$19,778,824, excluding HST
 - c) Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc. in an amount of approximately \$18,543,669, excluding HST

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand
Transit Services Contracts

These amounts would be paid by the Region over the initial five-year term.

Contracts include a renewal option for an additional term of up to five years.

The amounts include start-up activities, service delivery vehicle purchase, maintenance and fuel.

The contract start-up activities would commence on Monday, June 4, 2018 and would terminate at the conclusion of the service on Saturday, September 27, 2025.

2. Council approve the award of P-17-101 and authorize the execution of the contract for the operation, maintenance and storage of Region-owned buses and mini-buses, to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand transit to one contractor:
 - a) Tok Transit in an amount of approximately \$27,450,768, excluding HST.

This amount would be paid by the Region over the initial seven-year term.

The contract includes a renewal option for an additional term of up to three years.

The amount includes start-up activities, service delivery, maintenance of Region-owned and fuel.

The contract start-up activities would commence on Monday, June 4, 2018 and would terminate at the conclusion of the service on Saturday, September 27, 2025.

3. The Commissioner of Transportation Services be authorized to execute the option to renew the contracts, as specified above, subject to contractors meeting the performance targets identified in the contract throughout the initial term.
4. Council approve the extension of the current service providers, Cares Accessible Transportation, Mobility Transportation Specialists 2321190 Ontario Inc., and Royal Taxi, under contract numbers 82909, 82910, 82912, until the conclusion of service on September 29, 2018, at which time, the provision of the contracts will switch over to the contractors noted above.

2. Purpose

This report seeks Council approval to award P-17-92 to the three highest scoring proponents: Mobility Transportation Specialists 2321190 Ontario Inc., Care Accessible Transportation, and Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc. Each contractor would be responsible for the operation, maintenance, supply and storage of the sedans and accessible mini-van's required to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand service.

This report also seeks Council approval to award P-17-101 to the highest scoring proponent, Tok Transit for the operation, maintenance and storage of Region-owned buses and mini buses, assigned to operate Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand services.

Section 7, under 7.13 of the Purchasing Bylaw No. 2017-30, requires Council approval to award these contracts.

3. Background

York Region Transit (YRT) delivers Mobility Plus and On-Demand services using private contractors; all current contracts to deliver these services will expire on September 29, 2018

YRT's Mobility Plus service is a shared-ride, accessible public transit service for people with physical, cognitive, visual or sensory disabilities, who are unable to use regular public transit for all or part of their trip.

Since 2009, YRT has been operating limited dial-a-ride service across the Region.

In 2016, YRT began operating a new pilot On-Demand service model in the Towns of Georgina, East Gwillimbury, Aurora and Richmond Hill. On-Demand service operates during low-demand times and in low-demand areas to connect travellers to other conventional transit options.

A strategy that would see the expansion of the model was endorsed by Council in September 2017. Based on YRT's experience, it has been determined that the most effective and efficient way to deliver Mobility Plus and On-Demand service is to comeingle them.

Mobility Plus and On-Demand transit services will be comingled across the Region to assist travellers with the first and last mile of their trip, and to provide greater per trip efficiency in the delivery of transit

The comingled service model will be delivered using a mix of sedans, accessible mini-vans, buses and mini-buses to accommodate the various traveller demands and legislative requirements.

The sedans and accessible mini-vans will be owned and operated by three different contractors as they do now under the current contract. This allows for efficiency in operations of service, faster response times for travellers, and creates more availability for spontaneous travel.

One contractor will operate and maintain Region-owned buses and mini-buses. They will be assigned to areas where it is anticipated there will be a higher number of travellers. The buses also provide services to travellers that cannot be accommodated by either a sedan or mini-van.

4. Analysis and Implications

The contract procurement was a three-phased process that included an international best practice review, a Request for Information and a Request for Proposal

In November 2016, staff released a Request for Information (RFI) in preparation for the release of a Request for Proposal (RFP) for the Mobility Plus and On-Demand service. Staff also completed an international best practices review by interviewing transit agencies already operating, or preparing to operate, a similar service model. Some of these agencies included Orlando Lynx and Flex Denmark.

The purpose of the RFI was to generate interest and obtain input from industry experts and service delivery contractors. Nine companies participated in this process and were given the opportunity to provide comments and suggestions on how to best deliver a comingled Mobility Plus and On-Demand service.

Staff also took this opportunity to discuss with participants' the contract elements, such as contract term, potential cost drivers, performance measures, vehicle maintenance programs, safety and training and customer service.

Regional representatives from Transit, Legal, Finance, Audit Services, Risk Management and Procurement participated in the process.

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand Transit Services Contracts

Information gathered through the RFI process was used to develop the RFP and new draft operations and maintenance contracts

The RFP had two parts; Part A was the RFP document and Part B was the draft operations and maintenance contract document.

The draft contract document was developed using staff's experience and expertise and information obtaining through the RFI and best practice review. Updated contract highlights include:

- Five-year contract term, with an option to extend up to five additional years, for sedans and accessible mini-vans, at the Region's sole discretion. Contract term is determined based on the useful life of the vehicles
- Seven-year contract term, with an option to extend up to three additional years, for bus and mini-bus, at the Region's sole discretion. Contract term is determined based on the useful life of the vehicles
- Comprehensive standard operating procedures manual
- Annual rate adjustments that will vary between 1.98 and 2.98 per cent, dependent on the Consumer Price Index in the given contract year
- Vehicle maintenance program
- Enhanced operator screening and training
- Contractor performance management

Proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Region's purchasing bylaw

Both RFP's were created and released using a similar structure. Each RFP followed a two-envelope system, where the Technical and Financial portions are separated and opened during different times of the grading process, ensuring fairness and impartiality.

Interested proponents were invited to attend a bidders meeting on November 10, 2017 to discuss the overall RFP and to participate in a question and answer period.

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand
Transit Services Contracts

The RFPs were advertised on York.ca, Biddingo, the American Public Transportation Association, Ontario Public Transit Association, and Canadian Urban Transit Association websites, and in other industry publications.

Both RFPs received interest from a high number of proponent submissions, local and international contractors

Nineteen proposals were received between both RFPs as detailed in Table 1.

Table 1
Summary of Submissions Evaluated

P-17-92 Sedan and Accessible Mini-Van	P-17-101 Bus and Mini-Bus
Blue and White Taxi	Burt Transportation Services
Burt Transportation Services	Care Accessible Transportation
Care Accessible Transportation	First Canada Inc.
Checker Taxi	Mobility Transportation Specialists
Mobility Transportation Specialists	PW Transit Canada Ltd
PW Transit Canada Ltd	Royal Taxi York Region
Royal Taxi York Region	TOK Transit
Toronto Taxi-Cab Co-Operative	Voyago/Voyageur
Transdev Canada Inc.	Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc.
Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc.	

Prior to the proposals being forwarded to the evaluation team, the submissions were reviewed by staff in the Procurement Office to confirm the mandatory documents were submitted by all proponents.

Award of Mobility Plus and On-Demand Transit Services Contracts

Proposals were evaluated by a panel of staff and were scored on the basis of all information provided by the proponents

The panel consisted of two marking teams from Transportation Services, including Mobility Plus, Conventional Operations, Capital Assets and Corporate Risk Management. In addition, opinions were provided by Safety and Training, Enforcement and Security, Transit Management Systems and Information Technology staff. KPMG was hired to monitor the RFP process.

Each proposal was reviewed and scored by individual team members, followed by a consensus meeting to collectively determine each proponent's final performance score.

The total evaluation was based on a score of 100 points with 80 points for the technical and 20 points for the financial

The 80 technical point and 20 financial point allocations were endorsed by Council in October 2008 as part of the Contract Strategy.

To be considered for award, proponents required a minimum performance score of 70 per cent (49 of the potential 70 points allocated under the performance merit). Proposals that failed to score a minimum of 49 points were disqualified from further consideration and the financial proposal was returned to the proponent unopened.

The lowest financial proposal scored the full 20 points available. The other eligible proponents' financial scores were pro-rated. Pro-rating is the percentage difference between each of the financial proposals and the lowest financial proposal. The difference is then subtracted from the full 20 points to determine the financial score.

For both P-17-92, sedans and mini-vans, and P-17-101, buses and mini-buses, the recommended proponents have the highest total score

Table 2 provides a summary of the three proponents with the highest technical and financial evaluations for P-17-92, and are the three recommended contractors.

Table 2
Proposal Evaluation Results P-17-92
Sedans and Mini-Vans

Proponent	Technical Proposal out of 70	Interview Score out of 10	Financial Proposal out of 20	Total Score out of 100
Mobility Transportation Specialists	59.6	9.0	20.0	88.6
Care Accessible Transportation	58.7	9.0	18.0	85.6
Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc.	57.2	8.0	19.8	85.0

Table 3 provides a summary of the two proponents with the highest technical and financial scores for P-17-101. Tok Transit had the highest total score and is the recommended contractor.

Table 3
Proposal Evaluation Results P-17-101
Buses and Mini-buses

Proponent	Technical Proposal out of 70	Interview Score out of 10	Financial Proposal out of 20	Total Score out of 100
Tok Transit	61.3	9.0	19.1	89.4
Mobility Transportation Specialists	54.0	8.0	20.0	82.0

KPMG concluded in a letter that the process was undertaken in a fair, open and transparent manner

5. Financial Considerations

P-17-92, sedan and accessible mini-vans, was calculated based on the proposed start-up activities and estimated revenue service kilometres for years one to five

For P-17-92, the estimated total costs during the initial five-year contract term for sedan and accessible mini-van service for the three contractors is \$56,834,135, excluding HST.

These estimated costs include contract start-up activities, vehicle purchase, vehicles to be owned by the contractor and all operating and maintenance costs. The total amounts assume a two per cent annual increase and forecasted revenue kilometres to accommodate service growth during the initial five-year contract term.

P-17-101, bus and mini-bus, was calculated based on the proposed start-up activities and estimated billable service hours for years one through seven

The estimated cost for the initial seven-year contract term for the bus and mini-bus service is \$27,450,768, excluding HST.

This estimated total cost includes contract start-up activities and all operating, storage and maintenance costs. The total amounts assume a two per cent annual increase and forecasted revenue service hours required to accommodate service growth during the first term of the contract. The buses will be provided by the Region.

Sufficient funds are included in the 2018 Operating Budget for these contracts. Funds needed to deliver these services beyond 2018 will be included as part of the budget process.

6. Local Municipal Impact

Local residents who use public transit will benefit from the high standards imposed upon the Mobility Plus and On-Demand operating contractors.

The comingling of these services is anticipated to be an effective and cost-efficient way to provide these services to all residents during low-demand times and in low-demand areas.

7. Conclusion

Based on the results of the RFP process, staff recommends that Council authorize entering into five-year contracts with Mobility Transportation Specialists, Care Accessible Transportation and Wheelchair Accessible Transit for the transit operations, storage, and maintenance of the Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand Sedan and Mini-Van Transit service. Per kilometre rates compare with current rates paid by Mobility Plus and align with market rates identified through an industry review.

It is also recommended that Council authorize entering into a seven-year contract with Tok Transit for the operations, storage, and maintenance of the Integrated Mobility Plus and On-Demand Bus and Mini-Bus Transit service.

The hourly operating rate bid by Tok Transit, at approximately 30 percent less than the conventional bus service, yields a significant cost savings. Cost savings would be used to support transit system growth and/or improve service frequencies on high ridership routes.

It is further recommended that the Commissioner of Transportation Services be authorized to execute the options to renew the contracts, subject to the contractor meeting the performance target identified in the contract throughout the initial term.

For more information on this report, please contact Ann-Marie Carroll, General Manager, York Region Transit at 1-877-464-9675, extension 75677.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

April 19, 2018

8380113

Accessible formats or communication supports are available upon request